

## [Sample Independent Review and Consensus Review Forms and Agendas](#)

<b>Sample Independent Review Team Leader-Examiner Correspondence</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Examiner Feedback Form-Independent Review Scorebook</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Sample Consensus kick-off e-mail</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Consensus Call Ground Rules</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Sample Consensus Call Protocol</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Consensus Planning Call Agenda</b>	<b>8</b>



"Expected Results  
Matrix.xls"

---

Used by Team leader at the conclusion of the Independent Review stage  
Double-click to open

## Sample Independent Review Team Leader-Examiner Correspondence

Hello teammates! As promised, I have put some thoughts together that should be helpful as we prepare for the CPEX assessment process.

In reviewing the bios that you have sent I can only come to one conclusion. We have a very capable team. We have an opportunity to add great value to our applicant through our collective efforts and to learn a good deal from one another. What a privilege it is to work with each of you. My biography is attached for your information.

The Examiners that I know participate in the CPEX process for a combination of reasons. One is to grow professionally, another is to make a difference to their organization, and yet another is to establish a network of capable professionals. I suspect that each of you could add to the list. Let's agree from the outset that we will give this process the very best that we have. If we do, each of us will get the return on our investment that we seek.

The CPEX process is made more or less difficult in direct proportion to the quality of the Independent Review, which you are doing now. The diligent effort that you expend now will save us all a great deal of time during consensus and the site visit. Keep this principle in mind as you generate strengths, opportunities for improvement and scores. Always write your comments as if they were going directly to the applicant's management team as final feedback. In doing so, the remainder of the process is mostly editing rather than creating. There will be some comments that will get created during the Consensus meeting and site visit but those are usually less than 10% of the effort. We want to spend our time during the Site Visit learning more about the applicant and not generating initial feedback. Please put the time in up front.

Suzy Smith is our Back-up Team Leader. Her examiner experience will prove valuable to our team. Suzy will be in contact with you soon to determine your availability for an introductory conference call as well as the consensus meeting. Please be responsive to his request. We need to finalize the schedule as soon as possible.

Each of you will be assigned as the primary Examiner for one of the categories. You will also be designated as back up for another category. Suzy and I will make those designations after each of you has forwarded your bio to me. Please copy all the team members on those bios when you send them. We will make the assignments based on the overall strength of the group. Your responsibilities regarding these roles will be detailed in another communication as we draw closer to the consensus process.

Although the deadline for completion of the Independent Review is June 2, please send an electronic copy of your scorebook to me whenever you are finished. If everyone gets done before the 2nd we will have more time to prepare for Consensus.

# Examiner Feedback Form-Independent Review Scorebook

**Examiner:**

**Reviewed By:**

Scorebook Guidelines	Poor	Fair	Good	Above Average	Excellent
<b>Key factors Worksheet</b> (concisely present a bulleted list of the most significant facts and characteristics of the organization)					
<b>Item Worksheets</b>					
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Appropriate number of Strengths and OFI's for the Category/Item score</li> <li>▪ Number of comments is balanced across Categories</li> </ul>					
<b>Comment Guidelines</b>					
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Clearly describes the Strengths and OFI's with brief, simple, complete thoughts</li> <li>▪ Comments demonstrate knowledge of the purpose and requirements of the Criteria</li> <li>▪ ++/- - used appropriately</li> <li>▪ Figure references and figure titles used in Category 7</li> <li>▪ Comments are feedback quality. If poor or fair, circle specific problems from the list at the bottom of the page</li> </ul>					
<b>Overall Scorebook Quality</b>					

**Prescriptive**

**Judgmental**

**Conflicting Strength and OFI**

**Beyond Criteria**

**Parrots application**

**Critical tone**

**Vague**

**Too general**

**Comments**

---



---



---

## Sample Consensus kick-off e-mail

I want to officially welcome you to the CPEx Peak Examiner Team for application XXX.

My first question is how are you doing so far, are you on target to complete stage 1 Independent Review by XXX? Please reply to me regarding this as soon as possible and let me know if there is anything I can do to help.

I am not sure if you have done a Consensus or Site Visit previously so bear with me if I tell you things that you already know.

Prior to our evaluations being completed and distributed, I want to briefly explain the Consensus process.

- The first, and most challenging thing we need to do is figure out how we can all get together at the same time. We need to have an initial conference call early next week to discuss logistics. I am open to suggestions on a day, time, etc. Please complete the 'Dates Unavailable' form and **return to me by XXX**.

I will send out an agenda for the first call once we have a date

- I also need you to copy your Key Factors to a second document and **send them to me by XXX** so that I can consolidate them into one document. Please make sure that the *file name* includes your initials and the application #, *x-xxx*. We will use this method to identify all correspondence and attachments. We will discuss and hopefully agree to the condensed Key Factors on the first call.

Once we agree to our dates and times for the Consensus calls, each of us will be designated as an Item Lead for one or more of the 6 Items plus one of the Results items. We will also decide how much time everyone needs to finish his or her written portion of Consensus as an Item Lead.

### Your tasks as an Item Lead are:

- Unless we choose to hold our consensus meetings in person, it is not necessary to print the scorebooks that your team members will send you; it is easier to work with them on-screen.
- Condense the comments and scores of all examiners' evaluations into the 6-10 comments that you feel are most suitable for each item. All comments that you feel are not the "most important" to the applicant or are not as clearly written as another should be placed in the appropriate "below the line" section on the scorebook.
- We will not create Site Visit Issues until the Panel of Judges has reviewed our completed Consensus Scorebook.
- E-mail your completed Consensus scorebooks to all team members (I will distribute contact information after our first call)

When everyone has completed the above tasks, we will reconvene and each Item Lead will present their Items. During this process, we will collaborate on why a comment should or shouldn't be included or why your own comments may have been dropped to the "below the line" area. In most cases, you will find that we were all pretty close so it's often a matter of copy and paste with a little bit of modification to a comment. Secondly, you will present the scoring range for each Item. The main objective at this stage is to agree on comments that should be included and the score for each item. Please e-mail me with any questions you may have.

Thank you in advance for all of your hard work, I look forward to working with you on this challenging yet very rewarding journey,

Team Leader  
Phone number

## Consensus Call Ground Rules

- Be on time for all calls
  - Call in early to be sure you are connected at the start of the call
  - Identify yourself before speaking, at least until we all learn each other's voices
  - No one "owns" any item. We are trying to get the best collective thinking
  - We begin and end on time by sticking to the overall schedule of events
  - We listen to our timekeeper and actively manage our time
  - No cell phones or wireless phones on consensus calls (okay for planning call)
  - All deliverables are completed on time and distributed on time
  - We honor our scorebook editor's requests
  - We ask for help as needed to meet obligations
- 
- We make every effort to draft consolidated comments that are feedback ready
  - We listen to others' points of views, particularly those that are different, in addition to expressing our own view
  - We can and should offer different perspectives on our way to consensus
  - Consensus means we have heard, have been heard, and thus can and will support the team's outcomes
  - We will not proceed with the consensus calls if any team member is missing (unless prior arrangements have been made)
  - Each team member is responsible for the success of the team
  - Have fun!

## Sample Consensus Call Protocol

Our calls are scheduled for:

Tuesday, February 10 noon - 4 MST

Thursday, February 12 6 - 10 p.m. MST

Friday, February 13 noon - 3 MST

Call-in phone number:

Entry code:

Documents required for our Consensus calls:

- Consensus Review and Independent Review Examiner Handbooks
- Appropriate CPEX Criteria
- Consensus Key Factors and Key Themes
- Consensus comments from all category leads
- Any notes that will aid you in a concise presentation of your Category/Items (see example below)

The ground rules will apply for this call. In addition, we should remember

- Don't get bogged down in wordsmithing comments on the phone. We must reach agreement only on the thematic content of each comment.
- If you have a differing perspective, you need to speak up. Everyone's input is needed to create the best value to our customer.

The protocol for presenting each Category/Item during your category presentation includes:

- What the criteria are asking for.
- Most significant applicable key factors.
- Strength comments summary.
- Below the line strengths summary with rationale.
- OFI comments summary.
- Below the line OFI summary with rationale.

### Consensus Meeting Guidelines

- The Team Leader is responsible for the overall process and is accountable to the Sterling staff and the executive management of the applicant for the quality of the review.
- Category lead Examiners will facilitate Consensus for the items in their category. Use the following as the sequence for the discussion of your item(s):
- Introduce the item by highlighting the requirements of the Criteria.
- Identify the most relevant key factors and core values.
  1. Present your selection of strengths and opportunities for improvement.
  2. Highlight areas of conflict that surfaced during the preparation of your Consensus comments.
  3. Review the below the line comments and your reason for placing them below the line
  4. Ask for input from the team.
  5. Agree on changes to comments.

6. Review recommended score. Why did you select the score that you are recommending?
  7. Agree on score.
- Any Examiner who has an issue with the recommended strengths or opportunities for improvement should raise the issue during the discussion.
  - The purpose of the meeting is to reach Consensus on the best thinking of the team. If you agree with another Examiner's conclusion, indicate that you agree. However, there is no need to repeat what has already been said. When you disagree, make reference to the Criteria, the scoring guidelines and/or the evidence provided in the application.
  - The final Consensus scorebook is the focus of the Consensus process. Individual scorebooks are no longer relevant. It is not our purpose to defend our individual scores or comments.
  - Be on time for the start of the meeting. Do not schedule appointments that will put pressure on the conclusion of the meeting.
  - Always prepare your written feedback as if it were your last iteration before providing it to the executive management of the applicant. During the site visit it is much easier to edit than it is to create.

Thank you for your perseverance.

Team Leader

## Consensus Planning Call Agenda

Call-in phone number: Entry code:

Roll Call 5 minutes

Introductions 5 minutes

Disconnect Policy 2 minutes

(If we lose someone, we must wait until everyone is back online)

Site Visit Availability-tentatively scheduled for August- 3 minutes

Ground Rules review 3 minutes

Use of scorebook 7 minutes

- Writing Rules-Below the line
  - Key Factors-do we agree
  - Consensus Comments-see Consensus Review Examiner Handbook for more detailed steps
1. Examiners prepare a Consensus Item Worksheet for each of the items for which they are lead. These worksheets are a synthesis of the thinking reflected in the team's individual scorebooks. They are not merely a compilation of all the strengths and opportunities for improvement generated by the individual Examiners. Any comment that is not used must be listed "below the line" with an explanation of why the comment was not used. After preparing the strengths and opportunities for improvement, the lead Examiner refers to the scoring guidelines and includes a recommended score for the item.
  2. Lead Examiners exchange their Consensus Item Worksheets with their assigned back up. Back-up Examiners review the worksheets and give feedback to the lead in several key areas. First, are the strengths and opportunities for improvement grounded in the Criteria? Second, are the strengths and opportunities for improvement clear and actionable (see Feedback Comment Guidelines)? Third, is the recommended score compatible with the scoring guidelines and the written comments?
  3. The Lead Examiner incorporates the back up's review into his or her Consensus Item Worksheets as appropriate. Leads forward their Consensus Item Worksheets electronically to each team member no later than ???
  4. Each team member reviews the inputs from the other examiners prior to the consensus meeting. Note the issues and questions related to the consensus comments that you want to discuss during the meeting.
  5. Each lead will revise his or her Consensus Item Worksheets based on the results of the consensus meeting and send an electronic copy to the Team Leader by ???. These revisions become the basis for the final feedback report that the team creates on the last day of the site visit.

Team Roles

3 minutes

Team Roles Matrix			
Backup Team Lead	Mary		
Scorebook Editor	Harry		
Cat 1/7.6 Lead	Fred	Backup	Joe
Cat 2/7.3 Lead	Joe	Backup	Fred
Cat 3/7.1 Lead	Tim	Backup	Harry
Cat 4/7.2 Lead	Harry	Backup	Tim
Cat 5/7.4 Lead	John	Backup	Mary
Cat 6/7.5 Lead	Mary	Backup	John

No SVI's until after 6/11

I will distribute scorebooks after call.

Consensus Call Dates and Times-tentative for June 7

5 minutes

Consensus Call Overview-each lead will present

5 minutes

Confidentiality Procedures

5 minutes

- No cell or wireless on Consensus calls
- No use of the organization's name

Other questions?

3 minutes